

City Council Chamber 735 Eighth Street South Naples, Florida 34102

## City Council Regular Meeting – December 1, 1999 – 9:00 a.m.

Mayor Barnett called the meeting to order and presided.

ROLL CALL .....ITEM 1

**Present:** Bill Barnett, Mayor

Bonnie R. MacKenzie, Vice Mayor

Council Members:
Fred Coyle
Joseph Herms
John Nocera
Fred Tarrant

Peter H. Van Arsdale (Arrived 9:09 a.m.)

## **Also Present:**

Kevin Rambosk, City Manager Kenneth B. Cuyler, City Attorney

William Harrison, Assistant City Manager

Ron Lee, Planning Director

Jon Stager, Natural Resources Manager Don Wirth, Community Services Director

Ann Walker, Planner Cory Ewing, Planner Laura Spurgeon, Planner

Jessica Rosenberg, Recording Specialist Duncan Bolhover, Admin. Specialist

Arlene Guckenberger

Werner Haardt Reverend Holt

Clark Russell

Amy Rego Burt Saunders

Michael Simonik

Mary Brett

Jerry Degennaro Willis Jones

Tamela Wiseman

David Corbin
David Rice

Burt Binder

Virginia Corkran

Other interested citizens and visitors

Media:

AnneElena Foster, Naples Daily News

INVOCATION AND PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCEITEM	2		
Reverend Arthur Holt, Unity Church of Naples			
ANNOUNCEMENTSITEM			
None.			
ITEMS TO BE ADDEDITEM	4		
<u>Item 24</u> Purchase order for laboratory analysis of water samples in the Coastal Ridge	ge		
Wellfield area \ Vendor: STL Precision Laboratories \ Amount: \$28,350.00	\		
Funding: Water Distribution Fund.			
It is noted for the record that Council Member Tarrant left the meeting at 9:04 a.m.			
City Manager Rambosk asked to continue Items 18 and 19 to the 12/15/99 Regular Meeting; Ci	tv		
Attorney Kenneth Cuyler asked that Council continue Items 14 and 15 to the 12/15/99 Regul			
Meeting.			
MOTION by Herms to SET THE AGENDA ADDING ITEM 24 AND			
CONTINUING ITEMS 14, 15, 18 AND 19 TO THE 12/15/99 REGULAR			
MEETING; seconded by Coyle and carried 5-0 (Coyle-yes, Herms-yes,			
MacKenzie-yes, Nocera-yes, Tarrant-absent, Van Arsdale-absent, Barnett-yes).			
CONSENT AGENDA			
APPROVAL OF MINUTES	_9		
November 1, 1999 Workshop Meeting.	ш		
ITEM 5	_h		
APPROVE THE FOLLOWING SPECIAL EVENTS:	-10		
(1) Naples Power Squadron Boat Parade on Venetian Bay - 12/2/99			
(2) Coastland Center Mall holiday activities - 12/2-24/99			
(3) The Village on Venetian Bay entertainment events - 1/13/00, 1/27, 2/10, 2/24, 3/16, 3/24, 4/	6		
4/20, 4/28	Ο,		
(4) Taste of Collier (3rd Street South) - 5/7/00			
RESOLUTION 99-8701ITEM 5			
A RESOLUTION ACCEPTING AN EASEMENT, IN SUBSTANTIALLY THE FOR	_		
ATTACHED HERETO AND MADE A PART HEREOF, FROM FIRST UNION NATIONAL			
BANK OF FLORIDA FOR THE INSTALLATION, OPERATION AND MAINTENANCE OF			
A TRAFFIC SIGNAL SYSTEM LOCATED ON THE SOUTHEAST CORNER OF U.S. 4			
AND 9 <sup>TH</sup> STREET SOUTH; AND PROVIDING AN EFFECTIVE DATE. Title not read.	LT		
	. f		
AUTHORIZE A PURCHASE ORDER TO UPDATE THE 1996 DRAINAGE STUDY FO	D		
LANTERN LAKE \ ENGINEER: HOLE, MONTES & ASSOCIATES, INC., NAPLE			
FLORIDA \ AMOUNT: \$7,000.00 (NOT TO EXCEED) \ FUNDING: STORMWATE			
PROFESSIONAL SERVICES ACCOUNT.	11		
MOTION by Herms to APPROVE CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS 5-a, 5-b, 5-e,			
and 5-f and REMOVING ITEMS 5-c and 5-d FOR SEPARATE			
<u>DISCUSSION</u> ; seconded by Coyle and carried 5-0 (Coyle-yes, Herms-yes,			
MacKenzie-yes, Nocera-yes, Tarrant-absent, Van Arsdale-absent, Barnett-yes).			
END CONSENT AGENDA	_		
WANTE FURTHER PURI IC A DVERTIGING DEQUIREMENTS FOR SMALL AND MI			
WAIVE FURTHER PUBLIC ADVERTISING REQUIREMENTS FOR SMALL AND MIL			
SIZE LANDSCAPE INSTALLATION PROJECTS IN ORDER TO LIMIT BI			
INVITATIONS TO THE 5 QUALIFIED LANDSCAPING CONTRACTORS RESPONDING			
TO THE 10/99 REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS \ CONTRACTORS: CENTRAL FLORID			
LANDSCAPING, INC., TAMPA, FLORIDA; ENVIROSCAPE LANDSCAPING			

IRRIGATION, INC., BONITA SPRINGS, FLORIDA; LANDSCAPE FLORIDA, NAPLES, FLORIDA; AND STAHLMAN LANDSCAPE COMPANY, INC., NAPLES, FLORIDA. (9:05 a.m.) Council Member Herms stated that because of the possibility of emerging companies, the City should accept bids from all qualified firms. Vice Mayor MacKenzie agreed and cautioned that staff has not yet determined the efficacy of limiting contractors. Although City Manager Kevin Rambosk concurred, he noted the potential for delays.

It is noted for the record that Council Member Tarrant returned to the meeting and Council Member Van Arsdale entered the meeting at 9:09 a.m.

Council Member Herms further stated that the added competition may help the City to negotiate a more favorable price. Council briefly discussed whether amending the selection procedure would conflict with State law.

Public Input: None. (9:10 a.m.)

<u>MOTION</u> by Herms to <u>DENY</u>; seconded by MacKenzie and carried 7-0, all members present and voting (Coyle-yes, Herms-yes, MacKenzie-yes, Nocera-yes, Tarrant-yes, Van Arsdale-yes, Barnett-yes).

RESOLUTION 99-8702.....ITEM 5-d RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE CITY MANAGER TO EXECUTE AN AGREEMENT, IN SUBSTANTIALLY THE FORM ATTACHED HERETO, WITH CHANGES APPROVED BY THE CITY MANAGER AND CITY ATTORNEY, BETWEEN PARADISE CARRIAGE SERVICES AND THE CITY OF NAPLES, RELATING TO THE USE OF CITY STREETS AND DESIGNATED CARRIAGE STOPS WITHIN THE LIMITS OF THE CITY OF NAPLES; AND PROVIDING AN EFFECTIVE DATE. Title not read (9:10 a.m.). Noting the concerns of animal protection groups, Vice Mayor MacKenzie recommended allowing this service on a special permit basis only rather than a franchise. Mayor Barnett concurred and also cited various traffic issues. Vice Mayor MacKenzie proposed a motion to deny seconded by Mayor Barnett; however, further discussion ensued. Assistant City Manager William Harrison provided background information and noted that the City had previously awarded a contract to another company currently providing this service. City Attorney Kenneth Cuyler confirmed that Council may legally deny the proposed franchise, as it may deem that only one carriage company is necessary to provide adequate service. Charlene Casey, owner of Paradise Carriage Service, however said that she believed there is adequate work for both companies and that she could provide service for a variety of affairs and special events. Mr. Harrison proposed amending the franchise to restrict operation only to special events and Council briefly discussed limiting the franchise to one carriage.

Public Input: None. (9:31 a.m.)

<u>MOTION</u> by MacKenzie to <u>DENY THE FRANCHISE AGREEMENT AND ALLOW OPERATION UNDER SPECIAL EVENT PERMIT</u>; seconded by Barnett and failed 3-4, all members present and voting (Nocera-no, Herms-no, Van Arsdale-no, Tarrant-no, Coyle-yes, MacKenzie-yes, Barnett-yes).

MOTION by Herms to APPROVE RESOLUTION 99-8702 WITH THE STIPULATION THAT THE FRANCHISE BE LIMITED TO ONE CARRIAGE AND LIMITING THE AGREEMENT TO ONE YEAR; seconded by Tarrant and carried 5-2, all members present and voting (MacKenzie-no, Herms-yes, Van Arsdale-yes, Nocera-yes, Tarrant-yes, Coyle-yes, Barnett-no).

ORDINANCE 99-8703......ITEM 6
AN ORDINANCE ADDING ARTICLE V TO CHAPTER 58 ESTABLISHING AN
ADDITIONAL HOMESTEAD EXEMPTION; PROVIDING FOR THE APPLICATION OF
THE EXEMPTION; PROVIDING DEFINITIONS; PROVIDING REQUIREMENTS FOR
OBTAINING THE ADDITIONAL HOMESTEAD EXEMPTION; PROVIDING

**SEVERABILITY; AND PROVIDING AN EFFECTIVE DATE.** Title read by City Manager Kevin Rambosk (9:36 a.m.). Assistant City Manager William Harrison confirmed that this complies with State law, and explained that it would grant an additional Homestead Exemption of \$25,000.00 to those persons in the City at least 65 years of age who can document that they have a household income of less than \$20,000.00 per year.

Public Input: None. (9:38 a.m.)

<u>MOTION</u> by Nocera to <u>ADOPT ORDINANCE 99-8703</u>; seconded by Coyle and unanimously carried, all members present and voting (Coyle-yes, Herms-yes, MacKenzie-yes, Nocera-yes, Tarrant-yes, Van Arsdale-yes, Barnett-yes).

Public Input: 9:45 a.m. Joyce Brown, 1131 28<sup>th</sup> Avenue North, read a letter into the record requesting support for church services at Lowdermilk Park (Attachment 1). Dianne Mayberry-Hatt, 470 Banyan Blvd., representing the Coquina Sands Homeowners Association, urged that Council allow use of Lowdermilk Park on an occasional basis only. Lana Hope, 4801 Berkeley Drive, stated that she believed a church service to be an appropriate use for public land. She also observed that Council had conferred initial approval at the October 4<sup>th</sup> Workshop Meeting and requested that it honor this pledge without further impediments. Franklin Starks, 1717 Gulf Shore Blvd. North, representing the Gulf Shore Property Owners Association, urged that Lowdermilk Park be reserved for the quiet enjoyment of walkers and sunbathers, and that Council not authorize permits for any group on a permanent basis.

Council Member Nocera proposed a motion to approve for a one-year period which was seconded by Council Member Herms; however, further discussion ensued. Council Member Tarrant voiced concern regarding the impact to Lowdermilk Park, noting the church could also use various other locations in the County. Planning Director Ron Lee stated that the church should contact staff to ascertain whether there are special events scheduled for Lowdermilk Park, and relocate services as necessary. Council Member Coyle urged establishing a non-renewable time limitation noting the importance of the church obtaining permanent facilities. Council Member Van Arsdale stated that the design of Cambier Park is more conducive than Lowdermilk Park to large gatherings and Vice Mayor MacKenzie voiced concern regarding Lowdermilk Park's proximity to a residential area. After further discussion, Mayor Barnett proposed a compromise agreeable to Mr. Anderson; therefore, Council Member Nocera amended his prior motion.

MOTION by Nocera to <u>APPROVE RESOLUTION 99-8704 WITH STAFF</u> RECOMMENDATIONS AND WITH THE UNDERSTANDING THAT THE CHURCH MAY USE LOWDERMILK PARK FROM 12/5/99 UNTIL 5/1/00 TWO SUNDAYS PER MONTH; FROM 5/1/00 UNTIL 10/1/00 IT MAY USE IT EACH SUNDAY RESUMING WITH THE PREVIOUS SCHEDULE 10/1/00. THE CHURCH MAY USE CAMBIER PARK SUNDAYS NOT

LISTED ABOVE, HOWEVER IT WILL APPRISE STAFF OF ITS SCHEDULE. THIS NON-RENEWABLE AGREEMENT OF THE RECURRING USE OF LOWDERMILK PARK WILL EXPIRE 1/1/2001. This motion was seconded by Herms and carried 6-1, all members present and voting (Coyle-yes, Tarrant-yes, MacKenzie-no, Herms-yes, Van Arsdale-yes, Nocerayes, Barnett-yes).

Public Input: None. (10:22 a.m.)

<u>MOTION</u> by Herms to <u>APPROVE RESOLUTION 99-8705 EXPIRING</u>
<u>1/1/2001 WITH THE UNDERSTANDING THAT IT MAY BE RENEWED AT</u>
<u>THAT TIME</u>; seconded by Nocera and carried 6-1, all members present and voting (Coyle-yes, Herms-yes, MacKenzie-no, Nocera-yes, Tarrant-yes, Van Arsdale-yes, Barnett-yes).

RECONSIDER COUNCIL'S 11/1/99 CONSENSUS TO APPROVE A TIN ROOF AWNING ON A RESTAURANT AT THE WYNN BUILDING, FIFTH AVENUE SOUTH. (10:23 a.m.) Council Member Nocera proposed a motion to deny; however, discussion ensued. Planner Ann Walker confirmed that Council had conferred approval for a waiver for the wooden post and railing, but that the tin roof is allowed under the building code. Council Member Herms nevertheless noted he believed the issue to be whether property owners can build on public property. Council Member Van Arsdale explained that Council had approved the awning concept when it approved the general design of the adjacent plaza. Council Member Tarrant stated that he believed this awning is substantially different from the one at nearby McCabe's Irish Pub and seems to be a restaurant annex or veranda.

**Public Input:** 10:30 a.m. **Phil McCabe, 699** 5<sup>th</sup> **Avenue South**, McCabe's Irish Pub owner, noted that dining on public property is permitted in the Fifth Avenue South Special Overlay District. He further stated that Council had reviewed all aspects including design of the adjacent theatre and plaza as well as potential impact upon McCabe's and Wynn's restaurant before rendering approval. Council Member Herms however voiced doubt that the Council would have knowingly approved this use on public land and requested a thorough review of the records. Council Member Tarrant cautioned that this arrangement prohibits an open passageway for pedestrians.

<u>MOTION</u> by Nocera to <u>DENY THE RECONSIDERATION</u> (ALLOW THE <u>STRUCTURE TO REMAIN AS APPROVED</u>). This motion was seconded by Van Arsdale and failed 3-4, all members present and voting (Herms-no, Coyleno, Nocera-yes, Van Arsdale-yes, MacKenzie-no, Tarrant-no, Barnett-yes).

City Attorney Kenneth Cuyler proposed that Council delay further action until staff performs the aforementioned research. Mayor Barnett requested him to determine the City's cost in revoking the permit, as well as its potential liability. After further discussion, Council Member Van Arsdale reminded Council that Building Official William Overstreet had voiced concern regarding the placement of the posts, what he considered a permanent structure, in the right-of-way. (See November 1, 1999 City Council minutes.) At that time Council determined, and the owner agreed, to make the structure detachable. He added that Council had never discussed the tin roof awning, and expressed doubt that it had the authority to consider it at this time. (See Page 12.)

Public Input: None. (10:54 a.m.)

<u>MOTION</u> by MacKenzie to <u>APPROVE RESOLUTION 99-8706</u>; seconded by Nocera and unanimously carried, all members present and voting (Nocera-yes, Tarrant-yes, MacKenzie-yes, Coyle-yes, Van Arsdale-yes, Herms-yes, Barnett-yes).

A RESOLUTION GRANTING LIVE ENTERTAINMENT PETITION 99-LE2 FOR APPROVAL OF LIVE ENTERTAINMENT AT 699 FIFTH AVENUE SOUTH, MORE PARTICULARLY DESCRIBED HEREIN, SUBJECT TO THE CONDITIONS LISTED HEREIN; AND PROVIDING AN EFFECTIVE DATE. Title read by City Manager Kevin Rambosk (10:54 a.m.).

Public Input: None. (10:54 a.m.)

<u>MOTION</u> by Nocera to <u>APPROVE RESOLUTION 99-8707</u>; seconded by Van Arsdale and carried 4-3, all members present and voting (MacKenzie-no, Tarrant-no, Nocera-yes, Coyle-yes, Herms-no, Van Arsdale-yes, Barnett-yes). Planning Director Ron Lee noted that staff would amend the resolution to reference the plan of operation.

During the vote, Vice Mayor MacKenzie noted she could not approve live entertainment at this location due to its proximity to a residential neighborhood.

<u>MOTION</u> by Nocera to <u>APPROVE RESOLUTION 99-8708</u>; seconded by Van Arsdale and carried 4-3, all members present and voting (Van Arsdale-yes, Nocera-yes, Tarrant-no, Coyle-yes, Herms-no, MacKenzie-no, Barnett-yes).

A RESOLUTION GRANTING CONDITIONAL USE PETITION 99-CU23, FOR A LAW OFFICE AT LAKEVIEW MEDICAL PLAZA, 700 SECOND AVENUE NORTH, SUITE 102, MORE PARTICULARLY DESCRIBED HEREIN, SUBJECT TO THE CONDITIONS LISTED HEREIN; PROVIDING FOR THE CITY CLERK TO RECORD SAID CONDITIONAL USE; AND PROVIDING AN EXPIRATION DATE AND AN EFFECTIVE DATE. Title read by City Manager Kevin Rambosk (10:56 a.m.). Planning Director Ron Lee explained that the subject property is zoned "M" Medical District, which does not permit law offices and that the law firm currently operating in the district must therefore undertake the conditional use approval process in order to make it a legal use. Mr. Lee added that staff and the Planning Advisory Board recommend approval with the stipulation that the conditional use be restricted to present ownership. Petitioner and unit owner James Zonas stated that he primarily handles medical insurance claims, and that he believed his use of the property to be compatible with zoning.

**Public Input:** 11:00 a.m. **Robert Morgan, 700 Second Avenue North, #101,** Lakeview Medical Center President, requested that Council deny the petition as the building was developed for medically related purposes only. Mayor Barnett then read into the record a letter from another unit owner who sanctioned approval, but with the stipulation that all current owners in the building also be given a one-time exemption to lease or sell their units for non-medical use. (See Attachment 2.) Mr. Morgan reiterated objections as previously stated.

<u>MOTION</u> by Van Arsdale to <u>APPROVE RESOLUTION 99-8709 WITH THE PLANNING ADVISORY BOARD RECOMMENDATION OF NON-TRANSFERABILITY</u>; seconded by MacKenzie and unanimously carried, all members present and voting (Coyle-yes, Herms-yes, MacKenzie-yes, Nocera-yes, Tarrant-yes, Van Arsdale-yes, Barnett-yes).

RESOLUTION 99-8711......ITEM 21 A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY OF NAPLES. FLORIDA AUTHORIZING THE ISSUANCE NOT TO EXCEED \$9,000,000 GENERAL OBLIGATION BONDS OF THE CITY TO FINANCE THE COST OF ACQUISITION OF CERTAIN REAL PROPERTY LOCATED WITHIN THE CITY FOR OPEN SPACE AND OTHER PUBLIC PURPOSES; PROVIDING FOR AND CALLING A BOND REFERENDUM OF THE OUALIFIED ELECTORS RESIDING IN THE CITY TO BE HELD ON FEBRUARY 1, 2000, ON THE QUESTION OF THE ISSUANCE OF GENERAL OBLIGATION BONDS FOR SUCH PURPOSE; PROVIDING FOR OFFICIAL BALLOTS; PROVIDING FOR ABSENTEE VOTING; PROVIDING FOR REFERENDUM PROCEDURE; PROVIDING FOR REFERENDUM RESULTS; AND PROVIDING AN EFFECTIVE DATE. Title read by City Manager Kevin Rambosk (11:08 a.m.). Senator Burt Saunders referenced numerous occasions he had worked with the Trust for Public Lands (TPL), and recommended that Council request this organization's assistance with respect to the acquisition of the Fleischmann property. He added that recently enacted State law provides funding to cities and counties for the purchase of urban green space to be used for park purposes, and that the State may likely provide a matching grant should a local government raise half or more of the purchase price. Senator Saunders then explained that the TPL operates in several fashions; for instance, it may assist the local government in accessing state and federal funds, or assist in the acquisition negotiations. He confirmed that the TPL does not profit on the purchase or sale of the properties.

Council Member Coyle recommended that Council enlist the aid of the TPL and request Senator Saunders to expedite the application process, while simultaneously undertaking the bond referendum. Vice Mayor MacKenzie cautioned that engaging the TPL may however imply that voter approval is unnecessary but nevertheless supported proceeding with discussions. Council Member Herms predicted that the City will have purchased the property prior to receiving any grant money, and suggested that Council then decide whether to apply grant payments to debt service or purchase additional green space. Senator Saunders noted that the TPL had reviewed information on the Fleischmann property, and agreed that acquisition would be a significant public benefit.

Although conceding it was likely to be vetoed, Senator Saunders confirmed that the Collier County Delegation would address the issue of state funds for the rebuilding of the River Park Community Center. He added that there was also pending legislation regarding the prohibition of children traveling in the backs of pick-up trucks.

Public Input: None. (11:34 a.m.)

<u>MOTION</u> by Van Arsdale to <u>APPROVE RESOLUTION 99-8711</u>; seconded by MacKenzie and unanimously carried, all members present and voting (Coyle-

yes, Herms-yes, MacKenzie-yes, Nocera-yes, Tarrant-yes, Van Arsdale-yes, Barnett-yes).

It was the consensus of Council to direct Senator Saunders to contact the Trust for Public Lands to assist the City in the application process for the acquisition of State grant funds.

**Public Input (on continuance):** None. (11:36 a.m.)

<u>MOTION</u> by Herms to <u>CONTINUE ITEM 14 TO THE 12/15/99 REGULAR</u> <u>MEETING</u>; seconded by Van Arsdale and unanimously carried, all members present and voting (Coyle-yes, Herms-yes, MacKenzie-yes, Nocera-yes, Tarrant-yes, Van Arsdale-yes, Barnett-yes).

**Public Input (on continuance):** None. (11:36 a.m.)

<u>MOTION</u> by Herms to <u>CONTINUE ITEM 15 TO THE 12/15/99 REGULAR MEETING</u>; seconded by Van Arsdale and unanimously carried, all members present and voting (Coyle-yes, Herms-yes, MacKenzie-yes, Nocera-yes, Tarrant-yes, Van Arsdale-yes, Barnett-yes).

A RESOLUTION ABOLISHING THE ASSESSMENT DISTRICT FOR SECOND AVENUE NORTH, DIRECTING THE ASSESSMENT COORDINATOR TO CANCEL ASSESSMENTS, RELEASE LIENS ON PROPERTIES AND REPAY ASSESSMENTS MADE; AND PROVIDING AN EFFECTIVE DATE. Title read by City Manager Kevin Rambosk (11:36 a.m.). Assistant City Manager William Harrison explained that the rationale for considering rescinding assessment districts is due to the significant increase in revenue from the Tax Increment Financing district. Using overhead transparencies (copies of which are contained in the City Clerk's Office in the file for this meeting), Mr. Harrison explained that refunding the \$161,500.00 in previously paid assessments would not undermine the significant cash reserves of over \$1 million remaining in the Community Redevelopment fund. He also provided recommendations relative to additional capital

improvement projects over the next three years. Mr. Harrison clarified that the repayment would be a cash refund of principal payments only made on any property within any of the four assessment districts.

**Public Input:** 11:45 a.m. **Patrick Distasio, 720 Fifth Avenue South**, representing the Fifth Avenue South Association, voiced approval for abolishing the special assessment districts and received confirmation regarding the installation of paver crosswalks on Fifth Avenue South.

Mr. Harrison then provided clarification on the repayment from the Community Redevelopment fund to other funds, and confirmed remittance to the current property owners. He also noted that Council Member Nocera should abstain from voting on the assessment district on Fourth Avenue. (See Attachment 3.)

It is noted for the record that Council Member Coyle left the meeting at 11:55 a.m.

<u>MOTION</u> by Van Arsdale to <u>APPROVE RESOLUTION 99-8712</u>; seconded by Herms and carried 5-1 (Coyle-absent, Herms-yes, MacKenzie-yes, Nocera-yes, Tarrant-no, Van Arsdale-yes, Barnett-yes).

During the vote, Council Member Tarrant explained that he could not support this issue because he favors establishment of policy wherein business owners are exempted from stormwater fees.

Public Input: None. (11:56 a.m.)

<u>MOTION</u> by Van Arsdale to <u>APPROVE RESOLUTION 99-8713</u>; seconded by Herms and carried 4-1 (Coyle-absent, Herms-yes, MacKenzie-yes, Nocera-abstain, Tarrant-no, Van Arsdale-yes, Barnett-yes).

Public Input: None. (11:57 a.m.)

<u>MOTION</u> by Van Arsdale to <u>APPROVE RESOLUTION 99-8714</u>; seconded by Nocera and carried 5-1 (Coyle-absent, Herms-yes, MacKenzie-yes, Nocera-yes, Tarrant-no, Van Arsdale-yes, Barnett-yes).

Although voting in the affirmative, Council Member Herms stated that he did not support refunding all the money to the current property owners.

Public Input: None. (11:57 a.m.)

<u>MOTION</u> by Nocera to <u>APPROVE RESOLUTION 99-8715</u>; seconded by Van Arsdale and carried 4-2 (Coyle-absent, Herms-no, MacKenzie-yes, Nocera-yes, Tarrant-no, Van Arsdale-yes, Barnett-yes).

Recess 11:59 a.m. to 1:34 p.m. It is noted for the record that all Council Members were present when the meeting reconvened.

ORDINANCE (Denied) ......ITEM 9 AN ORDINANCE ADDING THREE NEW ZONING DISTRICTS TO ARTICLE II OF CHAPTER 102, ESTABLISHMENT OF ZONING DISTRICTS, OF THE CODE OF ORDINANCES IN ORDER TO PROVIDE ADDITIONAL STANDARDS FOR RESIDENTIAL DEVELOPMENT IN OLD NAPLES, PROVIDING A SEVERABILITY CLAUSE, A REPEALER PROVISION AND AN EFFECTIVE DATE. Title read by City Manager Kevin Rambosk (1:34 p.m.). Council Member and Old Naples Preservation Task Force Chairman Van Arsdale introduced other Task Force members and stated that the committee had painstakingly discussed all relevant issues in order to reach unity and a common vision for this area. He provided background information on the committee and initiated a slide presentation, a copy of which is contained in the file for this meeting in the City Clerk's Office. He defined the committee's purpose was to gather data through the evaluation of development patterns and zoning, perform field observations, and receive public input. The committee was also to identify major issues by housing type, identify alternatives to address each issue, and recommend development standard changes through committee consensus. Mr. Van Arsdale also explained that he had dismissed Amy Rego, Old Naples Association President, from the committee due to what considered to be egregious dissension.

Mr. Van Arsdale explained the two major areas of focus were garage doors dominating the street facade, and increased elevations due to Federal Emergency Management Agency (FEMA) regulations. He also noted other concerns such as excessive paving and stilt homes. After a thorough analysis of numerous homes, the committee identified what it deemed to be desirable aspects of the area including a grid street pattern with narrow streets and alleys, small lots, close connection of building to street, front porches, rear garages, and guesthouses. He thereby detailed the committee's recommended standards which would provide incentives as well as facilitate all desirable features. Mr. Van Arsdale particularly stressed the committee's guidelines for guesthouses, stating that the goals were to bring about compliance with scale and to strengthen the concept of a traditional neighborhood. He also detailed citizen surveys the committee had performed regarding guesthouses, noting that respondents indicated significant support. Later in the meeting, Committee member David Rice proposed that Council consider this issue separately due to its controversial nature. In addition, Mr. Van Arsdale stated that the committee had proposed extending the recommended standards from single family to multi-family, and proposed guidelines relative to the building of detached structures, subdivisions, and maximum length and height restrictions.

It is noted for the record that due to the amount of public input, registered speakers are listed as either opposing or supporting the project. Documents submitted by the speakers are contained in the file for this meeting in the City Clerk's Office. Summaries are provided for those speakers representing citizen groups or where Council participated in the discussion.

Amy Rego, 1060 Sixth Street South, Old Naples Association President (ONA), voiced opposition to the rezone, saying the plan is seriously flawed. In addition, she stated that Mr. Van Arsdale removed all opportunity for the input and representation of ONA after he had dismissed her.

Joe Sfara, 225 Central Avenue – opposed

Erika Henson, 347 Central Avenue – opposed

Chip Case, 255 Third Avenue North – opposed

Russ Reddick, 4031 Gulf Shore Blvd. North – opposed

Kim Case, 255 Third Avenue North – opposed

Charles Kessler, 525 Anchor Rode Drive, Old Naples Association Vice President, referenced Ms. Rego's dismissal, and added that a Planning Advisory Board member had disrespectfully treated ONA members when they had presented their views. He stated that incidents such as these create suppression of thought and a reticence of citizens to express their opinions, and therefore urged that citizens receive respect and consideration.

Burt Binder, 1155 Fourth Street South – opposed

Lois Selfon, 12<sup>th</sup> Avenue South – opposed

Lodge McKee, 53 Broad Avenue South - opposed

Karen Van Arsdale, 305 South Lake Drive – opposed

Anne Killilea, 623 Coral Drive – opposed

Bill Kaempfer, 550 First Avenue North – opposed

Carol Cleary, 141 Sixth Avenue South – opposed

**Michael Dedmore, 111 Capri Boulevard**, representing Del Mar Development of Naples, voiced strong reservations regarding the proposed changes to the multi-family code from both planning and design standpoints.

**Vernon Dibeler, 215 Second Street South** – opposed

Tom Gordon, 242 Second Avenue South – opposed

Gerard Barry, 211 First Avenue North – opposed

Doyne Basye, 175 Fifth Street South – opposed

Andy Messick, 651 Third Avenue South - chose not to address Council

Virginia Corkran, 213 Ninth Avenue South – opposed

Carol Lynn Kendall, 495 Galleon Drive – opposed

Fran Albergo, 376 Fourth Avenue South – opposed

## Recess 3:56 p.m. to 4:11 p.m. It is noted for the record that the same Council Members were present when the meeting reconvened.

Task force member Tamela Wiseman related that her family had chosen to relocate to this area because of its traditional neighborhood qualities; nevertheless, she cautioned that bad design elements are now appearing. Council Member Herms however stated that he believed the proposed plan would redesign multi-family zoning into unattractive row houses within single family areas, and voiced concern regarding increased density and negative spatial perception. He also noted that no public speakers had supported the zoning change. Council Member Van Arsdale said, however, that he surmised the public speakers voiced the minority opinion on the desirability of guesthouses, and added that he believed ONA itself is but a vocal minority. He added that the prevailing factor on building multi-family appears to be revenue-driven, and referenced what he considered to be several new unattractive developments. In addition, he reiterated that the task force would likely have benefited from the recommendations of outside consultants. Council Member Tarrant noted that he believed the plan is alley-oriented, and would thus require the paving, renovation, and modernization of the entire alley system. He also voiced concern regarding reduced property values. Council briefly discussed addressing certain desirable plan components in a workshop.

<u>MOTION</u> by Herms to <u>DENY</u>; seconded by Tarrant and carried 5-2, all members present and voting (Herms-yes, Coyle-yes, Nocera-yes, Van Arsdale-no, Tarrant-yes, Barnett-no).

During the vote, Council Member Coyle expressed appreciation to the task force, but stated that it had not built consensus. Vice Mayor MacKenzie concurred and agreed that a consultant would have been beneficial in the process. Council Member Nocera stressed the importance of an architectural design committee. Council Member Van Arsdale questioned whether the Council in fact strives to represent the needs of the entire City, or merely special interest groups. Council Member Tarrant stated that the public speakers, as well as the correspondence he had received, indicate a strong

consensus to deny the plan. Mayor Barnett suggested that some elements of the plan could be salvaged, and urged that this or a future Council work to resolve the problems in this area.

(Continuation of Item 10 discussion regarding the tin roof awning at Wynn's property – See page 5) (4:51 p.m.) City Manager Kevin Rambosk stated that he could not substantiate Council approval of the plaza plan. City Attorney Kenneth Cuyler stated that the reconsideration should have been restricted only to the permanency of the posts in the public right-of-way, and cautioned that the matter may not have been advertised properly. Council briefly discussed Fifth Avenue awning regulations. Council Member Van Arsdale however noted the distinction between the design of the plaza and the sidewalks along the street, and explained that the plaza awning criteria concerned roof pitch, wall dimensions, height, and balance. Council Member Herms however questioned whether the Fifth Avenue South Special Overlay District allows awnings with supports. Planning Director Ron Lee indicated he had found that awnings may not have ground supports. Although Mr. Van Arsdale noted that the plaza, as a public facility, does not have to meet applicable codes, Mr. Herms challenged the assumption that codes do not govern public space. City Attorney Cuyler read into the record the reconsideration request (Attachment 4), noting that it clearly indicates it concerns the tin roof awning. Mr. Lee stated that the Staff Action Committee (SAC) had determined that tin was an appropriate alternate building material for an awning. Mr. Herms however noted the awning requires a heavy beam structure for support, and should have required a variance. Mr. Van Arsdale noted Council had granted a waiver for the wood, and that after discussion with the Building Official, it had decided to allow the awning provided it can be removed quickly. City Attorney Cuyler cautioned that the City may face litigation if it disapproves the awning. Mr. Herms however warned that the structure may violate the City's own regulations. Council decided to continue the discussion pending research of applicable code concerning the use of public space. (See below.)

A RESOLUTION APPOINTING A SELECTION COMMITTEE FOR THE PURPOSE HEREINAFTER SET FORTH, RELATING TO PERMITTING AND PROJECT OVERSIGHT FOR THE PARKER SAND WEB PROJECT; AND PROVIDING AN EFFECTIVE DATE. Title read by Mayor Barnett (5:10 p.m.) Mr. Parker expressed concern that appointing a selection committee would further delay this project. Natural Resources Manager Jon Staiger however explained that the City must comply with state-mandated requirements in the selection of engineers.

**Public Input:** None. (5:13 p.m.)

MOTION by Barnett to APPROVE RESOLUTION 99-8716 APPOINTING COUNCIL MEMBER HERMS TO THE SELECTION COMMITTEE; seconded by MacKenzie and carried 5-2, 6-1 all members present and voting (Coyle-yes, Herms-yes, MacKenzie-no, Nocera-yes, Tarrant-yes, Van Arsdale-no, yes, Barnett-yes). During the vote, Council Member Van Arsdale stated that the project would be unattractive, costly, and inefficient.

IT IS NOTED FOR THE RECORD THAT LATER IN THE MEETING (See Correspondence & Communications) COUNCIL MEMBER VAN ARSDALE CHANGED HIS VOTE TO YES.

(Continuation of Item 10 discussion regarding the tin roof awning at Wynn's property – See above) (5:14 p.m.) City Attorney Cuyler cautioned that the only appropriate issue for Council consideration could be the tin roof awning and the permanency of the structure's beams, and reiterated that the tin roof is allowed by code. He stated that there may be other issues and problems, but that he and Mr. Rambosk would further research the applicable codes to determine whether the structure is a legal use within this zoning district.

**Public Input:** None. (5:20 p.m.)

<u>MOTION</u> by Herms to <u>DISALLOW THE HEAVY WOODEN SUPPORT</u> <u>BEAMS</u>; seconded by Tarrant and carried 4-3, all members present and voting (Coyle-yes, Tarrant-yes, MacKenzie-yes, Herms-yes, Van Arsdale-no, Nocerano, Barnett-no).

Public Input: None. (5:20 p.m.)

<u>MOTION</u> by Coyle to <u>ADOPT ORDINANCE 99-8717</u>; seconded by MacKenzie and unanimously carried, all members present and voting (Coyle-yes, Herms-yes, MacKenzie-yes, Nocera-yes, Tarrant-yes, Van Arsdale-yes, Barnett-yes).

RESOLUTION 99-8718......ITEM 17 A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE CITY MANAGER TO EXECUTE A CONTRACT, IN SUBSTANTIALLY THE FORM ATTACHED HERETO OR SUCH OTHER FORM DEEMED APPROPRIATE BY THE CITY ATTORNEY, BETWEEN THE CITY OF NAPLES AND HUMISTON & MOORE ENGINEERS, TO PROVIDE DESIGN **ENGINEERING** AND CONSTRUCTION MANAGEMENT **SERVICES** CONSTRUCTION OF T-GROINS ON THE NAPLES BEACHFRONT AT SOUTH GORDON DRIVE IN THE AMOUNT OF ONE HUNDRED FOUR THOUSAND FOUR HUNDRED SEVENTY FOUR DOLLARS (\$104,474.00); AND PROVIDING AN EFFECTIVE **DATE.** Title read by City Manager Kevin Rambosk (5:21 p.m.). Natural Resources Manager Jon Staiger explained that the project involves two T-groins and the reconstruction of two wooden groins. He confirmed that the project would be financed by Tourist Development Council (TDC) funds, and estimated the total construction cost to be \$625,000.00.

Public Input: None. (5:24 p.m.)

<u>MOTION</u> by Coyle to <u>APPROVE RESOLUTION 99-8718</u>; seconded by Barnett and unanimously carried, all members present and voting (Coyle-yes, Herms-yes, MacKenzie-yes, Nocera-yes, Tarrant-yes, Van Arsdale-yes, Barnett-yes).

**Public Input (on continuance):** None. (5:24 p.m.)

<u>MOTION</u> by MacKenzie to <u>CONTINUE TO THE 12/15/99 REGULAR</u> <u>MEETING</u>; seconded by Herms and unanimously carried, all members present and voting (Coyle-yes, Herms-yes, MacKenzie-yes, Nocera-yes, Tarrant-yes, Van Arsdale-yes, Barnett-yes).

**Public Input: (on continuance):** None. (5:24 p.m.)

<u>MOTION</u> by MacKenzie to <u>CONTINUE TO THE 12/15/99 REGULAR</u> <u>MEETING</u>; seconded by Herms and unanimously carried, all members present and voting (Coyle-yes, Herms-yes, MacKenzie-yes, Nocera-yes, Tarrant-yes, Van Arsdale-yes, Barnett-yes).

CONSIDER CONTRACTS WITH 7 ENGINEERING FIRMS FOR GENERAL CIVIL ENGINEERING SERVICES OF A LIMITED NATURE AND ON AN AS-NEEDED BASIS AS PROVIDED FOR IN CHAPTER 287.055, FLORIDA STATUTES \ CONTRACTORS: CAMP, DRESSER & MCKEE, INC., FT. MYERS, FLORIDA; WILSON MILLER, INC., NAPLES FLORIDA: HOLE, MONTES & ASSOCIATES, INC. NAPLES, FLORIDA; KIMLEY HORN & ASSOCIATES, TAMPA, FLORIDA; LAW ENGINEERING & ENVIRONMENTAL SERVICES, INC., NAPLES, FLORIDA; PELICAN ENGINEERING CONSULTANTS, INC., NAPLES, FLORIDA; AND HARTMAN & ASSOCIATES, INC., ORLANDO, FLORIDA. (5:25 p.m.). Vice Mayor MacKenzie referenced Item 5-c (regarding limiting landscaping contractors) and reiterated that she believed the efficacy of this practice is unproven. City Attorney Kenneth Cuyler detailed the selection process and confirmed that it had complied with the Consultant Competitive Negotiations Act (CCNA) process. He stated that staff has likely ranked the firms and will now negotiate contracts. He and City Manager Kevin Rambosk concurred that for certain disciplines, only one qualified firm responded to the competition.

Public Input: None. (5:30 p.m.)

<u>MOTION</u> by Nocera to <u>APPROVE ITEM 22</u>; seconded by Herms and unanimously carried, all members present and voting (Coyle-yes, Herms-yes, MacKenzie-yes, Nocera-yes, Tarrant-yes, Van Arsdale-yes, Barnett-yes).

CONSIDER AUTHORIZING A PURCHASE ORDER FOR LABORATORY ANALYSIS OF WATER SAMPLES IN THE COASTAL RIDGE WELLFIELD AREA \ VENDOR: STL PRECISION LABORATORIES \ AMOUNT: \$28,350.00 \ FUNDING: WATER DISTRIBUTION FUND. (5:30 p.m.) Natural Resources Manager Jon Staiger confirmed that analysis would most likely include pesticides and herbicides, and briefly discussed detection limits. Public Input: None. (5:31 p.m.)

MOTION by Herms to <u>APPROVE ITEM 24 WITH THE UNDERSTANDING</u> <u>THAT STAFF WILL CONFER WITH THE LABORATORY TO ENSURE</u> <u>THAT IT TESTS FOR CONTAMINANTS AT THE LOWEST LEVEL OF</u> <u>DETECTION AND THEN REPORT BACK TO COUNCIL</u>; seconded by Nocera and unanimously carried, all members present and voting(Coyle-yes, Herms-yes, MacKenzie-yes, Nocera-yes, Tarrant-yes, Van Arsdale-yes, Barnett-yes).

CORRESPONDENCE & COMMUNICATIONS (5:31 p.m.)....

Vice Mayor MacKenzie distributed a news release regarding the new River Park Community Center plans. / Council Member Tarrant requested a reimbursement of legal fees to residents at the Wilderness Country Club (Attachment 5). There was a motion (Tarrant/Herms) to give the Wilderness Club \$15,000.00 which failed 2-5 (Nocera, MacKenzie, Coyle, Van Arsdale, Barnett dissenting). Council however directed staff to investigate providing landscaping, such as on the median on Goodlette-Frank Road. / Council Member Coyle noted that he would be addressing the Legislative Delegation on December 2<sup>nd</sup> and requested direction from Council relative to its position on Tourist Development tax funds. Council Member Herms confirmed that Council would encourage the Legislative Delegation to permit Collier County cities some authority over the allocation of TDC funds, based upon population or other factors. / Council Member Van Arsdale changed his vote to

## City Council Regular Meeting – December 1, 1999 – 9:00 a.m.

reconsidered. / City Attorney Kenneth legality of campaign material posted on signs, especially when the vehicle is parked Hall.	em project) so that he could request that matter to be Cuyler noted that he would provide clarification on the door hangers, front yard signs and magnetic automobiled in City rights-of-way or in the immediate vicinity of City
<b>ADJOURN</b> (5:55 p.m.)	
	Bill Barnett, Mayor
Tara A. Norman, City Clerk	
D	
Prepared by:	
Jessica R. Rosenberg, Recording Specialist	

Minutes approved: 1/19/00